Corrigendum

Corrigendum to "enumerating permutation polynomials—I: Permutations with non-maximal degree"
[Finite Fields Appl. 8 (2002) 531–547]

Claudia Malvenuto[a], Francesco Pappalardi[b,*]

[a]*Dipartimento di Informatica, Università Degli Studi "La Sapienza", Via Salaria, 113, I–00198, Rome, Italy*
[b]*Dipartimento di Matematica, Università Degli Studi Roma Tre, Largo S.L. Murialdo, 1, I–00146, Rome, Italy*

Let $\mathbb{F}_q$ be a finite field with q elements and suppose $\mathcal{C}$ is a conjugation class of permutations of the elements of $\mathbb{F}_q$. We denote by $\mathcal{C} = (c_1; c_2; \ldots; c_t)$ the conjugation class of permutations that admit a cycle decomposition with c_i i-cycles $(i = 1, \ldots, t)$. Further, we set $c = 2c_2 + \cdots + tc_t = q - c_1$ to be the number of elements of $\mathbb{F}_q$ moved by any permutation in $\mathcal{C}$.

If $\sigma \in \mathcal{C}$, then the permutation polynomial associated to σ is defined as

$$f_\sigma(t) = \sum_{x \in \mathbb{F}_q} \sigma(x) \left(1 - (t - x)^{q-1} \right).$$

Therefore for $q > 3$ the function

$$N_\mathcal{C}(q) = \# \left\{ \sigma \in \mathcal{C} \mid \sum_{x \in \mathbb{F}_q} x(\sigma(x) - x) = 0 \right\}$$

enumerates the permutations in $\mathcal{C}$ whose permutation polynomials have degree strictly less than $q - 2$.

The reviews of the above-referenced paper that appeared in *Math Reviews* (MR1933624 (2003j:11146)) and in *Zentralblatt Math* (Zbl 1029.11068) point out that the case of transpositions provides a counterexample to the statement of Proposition 5.1. The statement is also obviously wrong in the cases of three-cycles and the case of the conjugation class of the product of two transpositions (see Theorems 1.1 and 3.1). For brevity, we will indicate these three classes of permutations, respectively, by [2], [3] and [2 2]. Other counterexamples to Proposition 5.1 occur if the characteristic of $\mathbb{F}_q$ is "small". The correct statement should read

Proposition 5.1. *Suppose $\mathcal{C} = (c_1; c_2; \ldots; c_t)$ is a fixed conjugation class of permutations which does not coincide with the classes* [2], [3] *and* [2 2]. *Then, if* $\mathrm{char}(\mathbb{F}_q) > 2$ *and does not divide* $2^{c_2} \cdots t^{c_t}$, *we have*

$$N_{\mathcal{C}}(q) = \frac{q^{c-1}}{c_2! 2^{c_2} \cdots c_t! t^{c_t}} \left(1 + O\left(\frac{1}{q} \right) \right).$$

Therefore, since $|\mathcal{C}| = \frac{q^c}{c_2! 2^{c_2} \cdots c_t! t^{c_t}} \left(1 + O\left(\frac{1}{q} \right) \right)$, *as* $\mathrm{char}(\mathbb{F}_q) \to \infty$, *the probability that an element of* $\sigma \in \mathcal{C}$ *is such that the degree* $\partial f_\sigma < q - 2$ *is* $\frac{1}{q} + O\left(\frac{1}{q^2} \right)$.

Proof. We associate to $\mathcal{C}$ the quadratic form in c variables

$$Q_{\mathcal{C}}(\underline{X}) = \sum_{i=2}^{t} \sum_{j=1}^{c_i} \left(X_{ij1}(X_{ij1} - X_{ij2}) + X_{ij2}(X_{ij2} - X_{ij3}) + \cdots + X_{iji}(X_{iji} - X_{ij1}) \right).$$

Let $\hat{N}(Q_{\mathcal{C}})$ be the number of solutions of $Q_{\mathcal{C}}(\underline{X}) = 0$ over $\mathbb{F}_q$ with all distinct coordinates. We have that

$$N_{\mathcal{C}}(q) = \frac{\hat{N}(Q_{\mathcal{C}})}{c_2! 2^{c_2} \cdots c_t! t^{c_t}} \tag{1}$$

since the denominator above counts the number of distinct representations of any permutation in $\mathcal{C}$ as product of disjoint cycles.

Next we consider the inequalities

$$N(Q_{\mathcal{C}}) - \sum_I N(Q_{\mathcal{C}}^I) \leqslant \hat{N}(Q_{\mathcal{C}}) \leqslant N(Q_{\mathcal{C}}),$$

where the sum ranges over 2-element sets of variables $I = \{X_{i_1 j_1 k_1}, X_{i_2 j_2 k_2}\}$ of the quadratic form $Q_{\mathcal{C}}$, where $Q_{\mathcal{C}}^I$ denotes the quadratic form in $c - 1$ variables obtained

by $Q_{\mathcal{C}}$ substituting $X_{i_1 j_1 k_1} = X_{i_2 j_2 k_2}$ and for any quadratic form Q, $N(Q)$ denotes the number of solutions over $\mathbb{F}_q$ of $Q = 0$.

Note that if $\mathcal{C} \neq [2]$, then $Q_{\mathcal{C}}^I \neq 0$ (indeed if X_{rst} is a variable not in I, then the coefficient of X_{rst}^2 in Q^I is 1). From this we deduce that $N(Q_{\mathcal{C}}^I) \leqslant 2q^{c-2}$. Hence we obtain that

$$\hat{N}(Q_{\mathcal{C}}) = N(Q_{\mathcal{C}}) + O(q^{c-2}). \tag{2}$$

Furthermore note that $Q_{\mathcal{C}}$ is equivalent to the form in $\tilde{c} = c - (c_2 + \cdots + c_t)$ variables

$$\tilde{Q}_{\mathcal{C}}(\underline{Y}) = \sum_{\substack{2 < i \leqslant t \\ j \leqslant c_i}} \left(Y_{ij1}(Y_{ij1} - Y_{ij2}) + \cdots + Y_{ij(i-2)}(Y_{ij(i-2)} - Y_{ij(i-1)}) + Y_{ij(i-1)}^2 \right)$$
$$+ \sum_{j \leqslant c_2} Y_{2j1}^2,$$

where the equivalence is obtained with the linear transformation

$$\begin{cases} X_{ijk} = Y_{ijk} + Y_{iji}, & i = 2, \ldots, t; \ \ j = 1, \ldots, c_i; \ \ k = 1, \ldots, i-1; \\ X_{iji} = Y_{iji}, & i = 2, \ldots, t; \ \ j = 1, \ldots, c_i. \end{cases}$$

If q is odd and $i > 2$, the $(i-1) \times (i-1)$ matrix

$$\mathcal{M}_i = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & -\frac{1}{2} & 0 & 0 & \cdots & 0 \\ -\frac{1}{2} & 1 & -\frac{1}{2} & 0 & \cdots & 0 \\ 0 & -\frac{1}{2} & 1 & -\frac{1}{2} & \cdots & \vdots \\ \vdots & \ddots & \ddots & \ddots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 0 & 0 & \ddots & -\frac{1}{2} & 1 & -\frac{1}{2} \\ 0 & 0 & \cdots & 0 & -\frac{1}{2} & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

associated to the quadratic form

$$Y_{ij1}(Y_{ij1} - Y_{ij2}) + Y_{ij2}(Y_{ij2} - Y_{ij3}) + \cdots + Y_{ij(i-2)}(Y_{ij(i-2)} - Y_{ij(i-1)}) + Y_{ij(i-1)}^2$$

has determinant equal to $i/2^{i-1}$.

To see this it is enough to notice that $\det \mathcal{M}_3 = 3/4$, $\det \mathcal{M}_4 = 1/2$ and if, for $i > 4$, we expand the determinant with respect to the first column, we obtain the recursive formula

$$\det \mathcal{M}_i = \det \mathcal{M}_{i-1} - \tfrac{1}{4} \det \mathcal{M}_{i-2},$$

which allows us to deduce the claim by induction.

Hence $\tilde{Q}_{\mathcal{C}}$ has discriminant $\Delta_{\mathcal{C}} = 2^{c_2} \cdots t^{c_t}/2^{\tilde{c}}$. This implies that if the characteristic of $\mathbb{F}_q$ is larger than 2 and does not divide $2^{c_2} \cdots t^{c_t}$, then $\tilde{Q}_{\mathcal{C}}$ is non-singular.

Therefore for odd characteristics coprime to $\Delta_{\mathcal{C}}$, we can use the formulas of [1, Theorems 6.26 and 6.27] to enumerate $N(Q_{\mathcal{C}}) = q^{c_2+\cdots+c_t} N(\tilde{Q}_{\mathcal{C}})$, obtaining

$$N(\tilde{Q}_{\mathcal{C}}) = \begin{cases} q^{\tilde{c}-1} + \eta((-1)^{\tilde{c}/2}\Delta_{\mathcal{C}})(q-1)q^{(\tilde{c}-2)/2} & \text{if } \tilde{c} \text{ is even;} \\ q^{\tilde{c}-1} & \text{if } \tilde{c} \text{ is odd,} \end{cases}$$

where η is the quadratic character of $\mathbb{F}_q^*$. Observe that the power of q in the first term above is larger than the one in the second term except when $\tilde{c} = c_2 + 2c_3 + \cdots + (t-1)c_t = 2$, which is satisfied only in the cases: $c = 3, c_3 = 1$ or $c = 4, c_2 = 2$.

Hence, if $\mathcal{C} \notin \{[2], [3], [2\ 2]\}$ and char$(\mathbb{F}_q)$ is odd and does not divide $\Delta_{\mathcal{C}}$, then $N(Q_{\mathcal{C}}) = q^{c-1} + O(q^{c-2})$. Substituting this in (2) and then in (1), we conclude the proof. □

References

[1] R. Lidl, H. Niederreiter, Finite fields, Encyclopedia of Mathematics and Applications, vol. 20, Addison-Wesley, Reading, MA, 1983.