

## On the maximum size of a maximal partial plane

K. METSCH

**RIASSUNTO** - *Un piano parziale di ordine  $n$  è costituito da un insieme di  $n^2 + n + 1$  punti e da una famiglia di sottoinsiemi di cardinalità  $n + 1$ , detti rette, tali che due rette qualsivoglia abbiano al più un punto in comune. Per  $n \geq 15$  si dimostra che un piano parziale di ordine  $n$  o è immergibile in un piano proiettivo di ordine  $n$ , oppure ha al più  $n^2 + 1$  rette e questa disuguaglianza è ottimale nel caso in cui  $n$  sia l'ordine di un piano proiettivo.*

**ABSTRACT** - *A partial plane of order  $n$  consists of a set of  $n^2 + n + 1$  points and a family of subsets of size  $n + 1$ , called lines, such that any two lines meet in at most one point. For  $n \geq 15$ , it is proved that a partial plane of order  $n$  can either be extended to a projective plane of order  $n$  or has at most  $n^2 + 1$  lines, and this inequality is sharp whenever  $n$  is the order of a projective plane.*

**KEY WORDS** - *Partial plane - Projective plane.*

**A.M.S. CLASSIFICATION:** 51E20

### 1 - Introduction

A partial plane  $\Gamma$  of order  $n$  consists of a set of  $n^2 + n + 1$  points and a family  $B$  of  $b$  sets of  $n + 1$  points, called lines, such that any two lines have at most one point in common. The partial plane  $\Gamma$  is called *maximal* if there is no partial plane containing  $\Gamma$  properly. The number of lines is denoted by  $b$ .

In this paper the possible number of lines in a maximal partial plane of order  $n$  is investigated. Z. FÜREDI and L. SPISSICH [3] showed that

a maximal partial plane has at least  $(3n + 4)/2$  lines if  $n$  is even and at least  $(3n + 3)/2$  lines if  $n$  is odd and this bound is sharp. On the other hand, any line of a partial plane of order  $n$  covers  $(n + 1)n$  of the  $(n^2 + n + 1)(n^2 + n)$  pairs of points so that the number of lines is at most  $n^2 + n + 1$  (here equality holds only if and only if any two points are joined by a line, which implies that every point lies on  $n + 1$  lines and in turn that any two lines meet so that the partial plane is a projective plane). Using a theorem of S. VANSTONE [6], it follows that any partial plane with mutually intersecting lines can be extended to a projective plane provided that it has at least  $n^2$  lines. Hence if  $\Gamma$  is a maximal partial plane with  $n^2 \leq b < n^2 + n + 1$  then  $\Gamma$  has a pair of disjoint lines. D.R. STINSON [5] showed that every such partial plane has  $b \leq n^2 + n/2$  lines, and Z. FÜREDI and J. KAHN [2] proved  $b \leq n^2 + n/3$ . In this paper, we improve these bounds.

**THEOREM.** *If  $\Gamma$  is a partial plane of order  $n \geq 15$  with two disjoint lines then  $b \leq n^2 + 1$ . Furthermore, this bound is sharp whenever  $n$  is the order of a projective plane.*

The following construction due to D.R. STINSON [5] shows that this bound is sharp whenever  $n$  is the order of a projective plane.

Let  $p$  and  $q$  be two points of a projective plane  $P$  of order  $n$ , and let  $L$  be a line other than  $pq$  passing through  $p$ . Remove the line  $L$  and all lines other than  $pq$  passing through  $q$  to obtain a partial plane  $\Gamma'$ . Then the set  $S$  consisting of  $q$  and the  $n$  points other than  $p$  of  $L$  meets every line of  $\Gamma'$  in at most one point. Hence we obtain a partial plane  $\Gamma$  if we adjoin  $S$  as a new line to  $\Gamma'$ . In  $\Gamma$  the line  $S$  is disjoint to all lines other than  $pq$  through  $p$ . Furthermore  $\Gamma$  has  $n^2 + 1$  lines.

Using the result of S. Vanstone mentioned above, we obtain

**COROLLARY.** *If  $n$  is not the order of a projective plane then every partial plane has at most  $n^2 + 1$  lines.*

It should be mentioned that the examples of a partial plane with  $n^2 + 1$  lines and two disjoint lines have been constructed starting with a projective plane of order  $n$ . This might indicate that the bound in the corollary is far from being best possible.

## 2 – Proof of the Theorem

The theorem will be proved indirectly. Suppose for the rest of the paper that  $\Gamma$  is a partial plane of order  $n$  with at least  $n^2 + 2$  lines and a pair of disjoint lines. We may assume that  $\Gamma$  is a counter-example to the theorem with the maximal possible number of lines (where  $n$  is fixed).

We use the following notation. The number of lines is denoted by  $b = n^2 + n + 1 - \alpha$  for some integer  $\alpha$ , which satisfies  $\alpha \leq n - 1$ . The set of lines is denoted by  $B$ . The *degree*  $r_p$  of a point  $p$  is the number of lines through  $p$  and  $d_p := n + 1 - r_p$  is called the *deficiency* of  $p$ . By  $p^\perp$  we denote the set consisting of  $p$  and all points  $q$  which are not joined to  $p$ . Since  $p$  is joined to  $r_p \cdot n$  points, we have  $|p^\perp| = 1 + d_p \cdot n$ . If  $p$  is a point of degree  $n$ , then the set  $p^\perp$  is called a *projective set*. Finally, a line is called *bad* if it meets some projective set in at least two points.

We shall show that distinct projective sets have a unique point in common, and that there exist more projective sets than bad lines. Then we remove the bad lines and adjoin the projective sets as new lines to obtain a new partial plane  $\Gamma'$ , which has more lines than  $\Gamma$ . The maximality of  $\Gamma$  implies then that  $\Gamma'$  can be extended to a projective plane, and this information will be sufficient to obtain a contradiction.

LEMMA 1. *If  $p$  is a point outside a line  $L$  then  $|L \cap p^\perp| \geq d_p$ .*

PROOF. This is clear, since  $p$  is joined to at most  $r_p$  points of  $L$ .

LEMMA 2. *If two distinct points  $p$  and  $q$  are joined then  $|p^\perp \cap q^\perp| \leq d_p \cdot d_q$ .*

PROOF. By Lemma 1, every line other than  $pq$  through  $p$  meets  $q^\perp$  in at least  $d_q$  points. Hence  $p$  is joined to at least  $1 + (r_p - 1)d_q$  of the  $1 + d_q \cdot n$  points of  $q^\perp$ , which implies that  $|p^\perp \cap q^\perp| \leq d_q \cdot n - (r_p - 1)d_q = d_p \cdot d_q$ .

LEMMA 3. *If a point  $p$  of degree  $n$  is not joined to a point  $q$  then  $|p^\perp \cap q^\perp| \geq n + 2 - d_q$ .*

PROOF. Set  $x = |p^\perp \cap q^\perp|$ . If  $p^\perp \subseteq q^\perp$ , then  $x = |p^\perp| = n + 1 \geq n + 2 - d_q$  as  $d_q \geq 1$ . We may therefore assume that  $p^\perp$  is not contained in  $q^\perp$ . Choose a point  $s$  of maximum degree of  $p^\perp - q^\perp$ , set  $d = d_q$  and  $e = d_s$ . The lines  $\neq sq$  through  $s$  join  $s$  to at least  $(r_s - 1)d$  points of  $q^\perp$  (Lemma 1) and therefore to at least  $(r_s - 1) \cdot d - |q^\perp - p^\perp| = (n - e)d - |q^\perp| + |q^\perp \cap p^\perp| = (n - e)d - (1 + dn) + x = x - 1 - de$  points of  $p^\perp \cap q^\perp$ . Since  $q$  is joined to  $|p^\perp - q^\perp| = n + 1 - x$  points of  $p^\perp$  and since every line  $L$  meets  $p^\perp$  in at least one point (Lemma 1), it follows that  $\sum_L (|L \cap p^\perp| - 1) \geq x - 1 - de + n + 1 - x = n - de$ . Now count incident point line pairs  $(y, L)$  with  $y$  in  $p^\perp$  to obtain

$$\sum_{y \in p^\perp} r_y = \sum_{L \in B} |L \cap p^\perp| = b + \sum_{L \in B} (|L \cap p^\perp| - 1) \geq b + n - de \geq n^2 + 2 + n - de.$$

On the other hand (notice that every point of  $p^\perp - \{p\}$  has degree at most  $n$ , since it is not joined to  $p$ , while the  $n + 1 - x$  points of  $p^\perp - q^\perp$  have degree at most  $n + 1 - e$ )

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{y \in p^\perp} r_y &\leq r_q + |(p^\perp \cap q^\perp) - \{q\}| \cdot n + |p^\perp - q^\perp| \cdot (n + 1 - e) \\ &= (n + 1 - d) + (x - 1)n + (n + 1 - x)(n + 1 - e) \\ &= n^2 + n + 1 - d - (n + 1 - x)(e - 1). \end{aligned}$$

Hence  $1 + (n + 1 - x)(e - 1) \leq d(e - 1)$ , in particular  $e \neq 1$  and therefore  $n + 1 - x < d$ , i. e.  $x > n + 1 - d$ .

LEMMA 4. *If points  $p$  and  $q$  of degree  $n$  are not joined then  $p^\perp = q^\perp$ .*

PROOF. This is immediate from the preceding lemma.

LEMMA 5. *Distinct projective sets have a unique point in common.*

PROOF. Let  $p^\perp$  and  $q^\perp$  be distinct projective sets. Then  $p$  and  $q$  are joined (Lemma 4) and  $p^\perp$  and  $q^\perp$  have at most one point in common (Lemma 2). Assume by way of contradiction that  $p^\perp$  and  $q^\perp$  are disjoint, and denote by  $x$  resp.  $y$  the number of  $n$ -points in  $p^\perp$  resp.  $q^\perp$ . We may assume that  $x \geq y$ .

Suppose that  $s$  is a point of degree  $n$  of  $p^\perp$ . Since  $s^\perp = p^\perp$  (Lemma 4), the point  $s$  is joined to every point of  $q^\perp$ . Hence  $s$  lies on a line which has at least two points in  $q^\perp$ . If  $s$  and  $s'$  are distinct points of degree  $n$  of  $p^\perp$  then  $s^\perp = p^\perp = s'^\perp$  implies that  $s$  and  $s'$  are not on a common line. It follows that there are at least  $x$  different lines which have two points in  $q^\perp$ . Counting incident point line pairs  $(z, Z)$  with  $z$  in  $q^\perp$  and using Lemma 1, we obtain

$$\sum_{z \in q^\perp} r_z = \sum_{Z \in B} |Z \cap q^\perp| \geq 2x + (b - x) \geq n^2 + 2 + x.$$

On the other hand

$$\sum_{z \in q^\perp} r_z \leq yn + (n + 1 - y)(n - 1) = n^2 - 1 + y.$$

Hence  $x < y$ , a contradiction.

**LEMMA 6.** *Every point of degree  $\leq n$  lies in a projective set.*

**PROOF.** Let  $p$  be a point of degree  $n + 1 - d < n + 1$ . Then every point of  $p^\perp - \{p\}$  has degree at most  $n$ , since a point of degree  $n + 1$  is joined to every other point. Furthermore, every line not passing through  $p$  meets  $p^\perp - \{p\}$  in at least  $d$  points (Lemma 1). Counting incident point-line pairs  $(q, L)$  with  $q \in p^\perp - \{p\}$ , we obtain

$$\sum_{q \in p^\perp - \{p\}} r_q \geq (b - r_p)d \geq (b - n)d \geq (n^2 - n + 2)d > dn(n - 1).$$

Since  $|p^\perp - \{p\}| = dn$ , it follows that some point of  $p^\perp - \{p\}$  has degree at least  $n$ .

**LEMMA 7.** *The sum  $\sum d_p$  of the deficiencies  $d_p$  of all points  $p$  equals  $\alpha(n + 1)$ .*

**PROOF.** Since there are  $n^2 + n + 1$  points, this follows from  $\sum r_p = b(n + 1)$  and  $b = n^2 + n + 1 - \alpha$ .

LEMMA 8. *There are at least  $\alpha/2$  different projective sets.*

PROOF. In view of  $\alpha \leq n - 1$ , the preceding lemma shows that it exists a point  $p$  of degree  $n + 1$ . Let  $L$  be a line through  $p$ , let  $p_1, \dots, p_s$  be the points of  $L$  which have not degree  $n + 1$ , and denote the deficiency of  $p_j$  by  $d_j$ . Since  $p$  has degree  $n + 1$ , it is joined to every other point, which implies that the lines through  $p$  meet every other line. Hence, the line  $L$  meets every other line, which implies that  $\sum d_j = \alpha$ . The set  $p_j^\perp$  has  $1 + d_j n$  points and distinct sets  $p_j^\perp$  and  $p_k^\perp$  have at most  $d_j d_k$  points in common (Lemma 2). Since every point contained in one of the sets  $p_j^\perp$  has degree at most  $n$ , it follows that the number of points of degree  $\leq n$  is at least

$$\sum_{j=1}^s (1 + d_j n) - \sum_{j < k} d_j d_k = s + \alpha n - \frac{1}{2} \left( \alpha^2 - \sum_{j=1}^s d_j^2 \right) > 1 + \alpha n - \frac{1}{2} \alpha^2 > 1 + \frac{1}{2} \alpha n.$$

Suppose there are fewer than  $\frac{1}{2} \alpha$  distinct projective sets, say  $q_1^\perp, \dots, q_m^\perp$  with  $m < \frac{1}{2} \alpha$ . By Lemma 6, the union of the projective sets is the set of points of degree at most  $n$ . Now (see Lemma 5)

$$\begin{aligned} \left| \bigcup_{j=1}^m q_j^\perp \right| &\leq |q_1^\perp| + |q_2^\perp - q_1^\perp| + \dots + |q_m^\perp - q_1^\perp| \\ &= n + 1 + (m - 1)n = 1 + mn < 1 + \frac{1}{2} \alpha n, \end{aligned}$$

But every point of degree  $\leq n$  lies in one of the projective sets  $q_j^\perp$ , a contradiction.

LEMMA 9. *It exists a bad line.*

PROOF. Since  $\Gamma$  is a counterexample to our theorem with the maximum number of lines, every projective set  $S$  contains two points which are joined (if not we could adjoin  $S$  as a new line), i.e. every projective set meets some bad line in two points. Hence if  $\alpha > 0$  then there is a bad line (Lemma 8). But we have already noticed in the introduction that every partial plane has at most  $n^2 + n + 1$  lines with equality if and only if it is a projective plane. Since  $\Gamma$  has disjoint lines, it is certainly not a projective plane, so  $\alpha = n^2 + n + 1 - b > 0$ .

LEMMA 10. *Every point of a bad line has degree at most  $n - 1$ .*

PROOF. Suppose  $L$  is a bad line which intersects the projective set  $p^\perp$  in two points. By Lemma 4, the points of  $L \cap p^\perp$  have degree at most  $n - 1$ . Now let  $q$  be a point of  $L - p^\perp$ . Then  $q$  has not degree  $n + 1$ , because every line through a point of degree  $n + 1$  intersects  $p^\perp$  (Lemma 1) in a (necessarily) unique point.

Assume that  $q$  has degree  $n$ . Since every line through  $q$  meets  $p^\perp$  and since  $L$  meets  $p^\perp$  in two points, it follows that  $q$  is joined to each of the  $n + 1$  points of  $p^\perp$ . But this implies that the projective sets  $p^\perp$  and  $q^\perp$  are disjoint, which contradicts Lemma 5.  $\square$

LEMMA 11. *It two points  $x$  and  $y$  of a projective set  $p^\perp$  are joined then  $(d_x + 1)(d_y + 1) \geq n + 4$ .*

PROOF. By Lemma 3 we have  $|p^\perp \cap x^\perp| \geq n + 2 - d_x$  and  $|p^\perp \cap y^\perp| \geq n + 2 - d_y$  and Lemma 2 shows that  $|x^\perp \cap y^\perp| \leq d_x d_y$ . It follows that

$$2n + 4 - d_x - d_y \leq |p^\perp \cap x^\perp| + |p^\perp \cap y^\perp| \leq |p^\perp| + |p^\perp \cap x^\perp \cap y^\perp| \leq n + 1 + d_x d_y.$$

Consequently  $(d_x + 1)(d_y + 1) \geq n + 4$ .

LEMMA 12. *If  $n \geq 3$ , then there are at most  $n - 2$  bad lines.*

PROOF. Let  $M$  be any set of  $n + 1 - \beta$  bad lines with some integer  $\beta \geq 0$ . Since distinct lines meet in at most one point, the lines of  $M$  cover at least  $\frac{1}{2}(n + 2)(n + 1) - \frac{1}{2}(\beta + 1)\beta$  points. Since every point of a bad line has deficiency at least 2 (Lemma 10), Lemma 7 implies that  $(n + 2)(n + 1) - (\beta + 1)\beta \leq \alpha(n + 1)$ . In view of  $\alpha \leq n - 1$ , it follows that  $\beta(\beta + 1) \geq 3(n + 1)$  so that  $\beta \geq 3$ .  $\square$

LEMMA 13. *If  $n \geq 13$  then there are more projective sets than bad lines.*

**PROOF.** Let  $n + 1 - \beta$  be the number of bad lines and assume that there are at most  $n + 1 - \beta$  projective sets. Let  $S$  be the set of points which have degree at most  $n - 3$ , and set  $s = |S|$ .

If  $L$  is a bad line then every point of  $L$  lies in a projective set (Lemma 6 and Lemma 10). In view of  $n \geq 13$ , Lemma 11 shows that a projective set contains at most one point of  $L - S$ . Since there are at most  $n + 1 - \beta$  projective sets, it follows that every bad line contains at least  $\beta$  points of  $S$ . Let  $w$  be the number of points covered by all bad lines. As in the proof of Lemma 12 we have  $2w \geq (n + 2)(n + 1) - (\beta + 1)\beta$ . Since points of bad lines have deficiency at least 2 (Lemma 10) and since the points of  $S$  have deficiency at least 4, we have  $2w + 2s = (w - s) \cdot 2 + s \cdot 4 \leq \alpha(n + 1)$  by Lemma 7. Hence  $2s \leq \beta(\beta + 1) - (n + 2 - \alpha)(n + 1)$ .

Consider first the case that  $n + 1 - \beta \geq \beta$  so that there are at least  $\beta$  bad lines. Then  $s \geq \frac{1}{2}(\beta + 1)\beta$ , since a bad line contains at least  $\beta$  points of  $S$ . But we have just shown that  $2s < \beta(\beta + 1)$ , a contradiction.

Now suppose that  $\beta \geq n + 1 - \beta$ . Since each of the  $n + 1 - \beta$  bad lines contains at least  $\beta$  points of  $S$ , it follows that  $s \geq \beta + (\beta - 1) + \dots + [\beta - (n - \beta)]$  so that  $2s \geq (\beta + 1)\beta - (2\beta - n)(2\beta - n - 1)$ . Together with the upper bound for  $2s$  we obtain  $(n + 2 - \alpha)(n + 1) \leq (2\beta - n)(2\beta - n - 1)$  or  $2(n + 1) + 2\beta(2n + 1 - 2\beta) \leq \alpha(n + 1)$ . In view of  $2\beta \geq n + 1$ , it follows that  $2(n + 1) + (n + 1)(2n + 1 - 2\beta) \leq \alpha(n + 1)$  which implies that  $1 + 2(n + 1 - \beta) \leq \alpha$  or  $n + 1 - \beta < \frac{1}{2}\alpha$ . Since there are at most  $n + 1 - \beta$  projective sets, this contradicts Lemma 8.  $\square$

Let  $\Gamma'$  be the partial plane obtained from  $\Gamma$  by removing the bad lines. Then each line of  $\Gamma'$  meets each projective set in at most one point. Lemma 5 shows that we obtain again a partial plane  $\Gamma''$  if we add the projective sets as new lines to  $\Gamma'$ . By the preceding lemma,  $\Gamma''$  has more lines than  $\Gamma$ . The choice of  $\Gamma$  implies now that  $\Gamma''$  can be extended to a projective plane  $\mathbf{P}$  of order  $n$ . Since  $\Gamma$  has at least  $n^2 + 2$  lines, it follows that  $\Gamma'$  can be extended to the same projective plane by adjoining at most  $n - 1 + \delta$  lines where  $\delta$  is the number of bad lines of  $\Gamma$ . By Lemma 12, we have  $\delta \leq n - 2$ . Since the points of degree  $n + 1$  of  $\Gamma$  have still degree  $n + 1$  in  $\Gamma'$  (Lemma 10), the partial plane  $\Gamma'$  has at least  $n^2 + n + 1 - \alpha(n + 1) \geq n + 2$  points of degree  $n + 1$  (Lemma 7). Let  $S_1, \dots, S_\delta$  be the bad lines of  $\Gamma$  and denote by  $D$  the set of lines of  $\mathbf{P}$  which are not lines of  $\Gamma'$ . Since  $D$  contains the projective sets of  $\Gamma$ , each



line  $S_j$  meets some line of  $D$  in at least two points. Therefore each bad line  $S_j$  of  $\Gamma$  is a set of  $n+1$  non-collinear points of the projective plane  $\mathbf{P}$ . The following proposition shows that we have derived a situation which is not possible and this completes the proof of the theorem.

**PROPOSITION 14.** *Suppose  $\mathbf{P}$  is a projective plane of order  $n \geq 15$  and let  $\delta$  be a positive integer. Suppose furthermore that there exists a set  $D$  consisting of (at most)  $n-1+\delta$  lines and sets  $S_1, \dots, S_\delta$  of points satisfying the following properties.*

- (1) *Each set  $S_j$  consists of  $n+1$  non-collinear points.*
- (2) *Any two points of  $S_j$  are joined by a line of  $D$ .*
- (3) *Distinct sets  $S_j$  share at most one point.*
- (4) *At least  $n+2$  points do not lie on any line of  $D$ .*

*Then  $\delta \geq n-1$ .*

**PROOF.** Assume by way of contradiction that  $\delta \leq n-2$ . For every point  $p$ , we denote by  $d_p$  the number of lines of  $D$  passing through  $p$ , and we call  $d_p$  the deficiency of  $p$ .

Since the points of  $S_1$  are non-collinear, the lines (of  $D$ ) which have at least two points in  $S_1$  induce a linear space  $\mathbf{L}$  on the points of  $S_1$ . Since every linear space has at least as many lines as points (see [1]), it follows that  $D$  has at least  $n+1$  lines. Hence  $\delta \geq 2$ .

We define a function  $f(x) := (x+1)^2(n-x)$  for real values of  $x$ . Since  $f$  has two extrema one of which for  $x = -1$ , it follows that  $f(x_1) \leq f(x) \leq f(x_2)$  for all real  $x, x_1, x_2$  with  $0 \leq x_1 \leq x \leq x_2$ . Denote by  $k+1$  the maximum line degree of  $\mathbf{L}$ . Then  $k \leq n-1$  and  $\mathbf{L}$  has at least  $1 + (f(k)/n)$  lines (see [4]). Since the lines of  $\mathbf{L}$  are induced by the lines of  $D$ , it follows that  $f(k) \leq (|D|-1) \cdot n = (n-2+\delta)n$ . Since  $\delta \leq n-2$ ,  $f(\sqrt{(2n)}) \geq 2n^2$  and  $f(n-2) \geq 2n^2$ , it follows from the above properties of  $f$  that  $k = n-1$  or  $k < \sqrt{(2n)}$ . However  $k = n-1$  is not possible. (Assume to the contrary that there is a line  $L$  in  $D$  which meets  $S_1$  in  $n$  points. Then the point of  $S_1 - L$  is joined to the  $n$  points of  $L \cap S_1$  by lines of  $D$ , which implies that the lines of  $D$  cover at least  $n^2+1$  points. This contradicts condition (4)). Hence  $k < \sqrt{(2n)}$ . If  $\delta \leq 3$  then  $f(k) \leq (n+1)n$ , and the same argument shows in this case that  $k < \sqrt{n}$ .

Let  $p$  be a point of  $\mathbf{L}$ . Since  $p$  is joined to every other point of  $\mathbf{L}$  by a line of degree at most  $k+1$ , it follows that  $p$  has degree at least  $n/k$

in  $\mathbf{L}$ . Hence every point of  $\mathbf{L}$  lies on at least  $n/k$  lines of  $D$ , i.e. every point of  $S_1$  has deficiency  $d_p \geq n/k$ . The same argument shows that every point contained in one of the sets  $S_j$  has deficiency at least  $n/k$ . Let  $S$  be the union of the sets  $S_1, \dots, S_\delta$ . Since any two distinct sets  $S_j$  share at most one point, we have  $|S| \geq (n+1) + n + \dots + (n+2-\delta) = \frac{1}{2}(n+2)(n+1) - \frac{1}{2}(n+2-\delta)(n+1-\delta) = \frac{1}{2}\delta(2n+3-\delta)$ . Counting in two ways triples  $(p, L_1, L_2)$  consisting of a point  $p$  and distinct lines  $L_1, L_2$  of  $D$  which intersect in  $p$ , we obtain  $\sum d_p(d_p-1) = |D|(|D|-1) \leq (n-1+\delta)(n-2+\delta)$ . Since the points of  $S$  have deficiency at least  $n/k$  it follows that

$$(1) \quad \delta(2n+3-\delta)n(n-k) \leq 2(n-1+\delta)(n-2+\delta)k^2.$$

First suppose that  $\delta \in \{2, 3\}$ . Then  $k < \sqrt{n}$  and (1) yields

$$(2) \quad \delta(2n+3-\delta)(n-\sqrt{n}) < 2(n-1+\delta)(n-2+\delta).$$

In view of  $n \geq 15$  and  $\delta \in \{2, 3\}$ , this is a contradiction.

Hence  $4 \leq \delta \leq n-2$ . Now  $k < \sqrt{2n}$  and (1) yields

$$(3) \quad g(\delta) := \frac{\delta(2n+3-\delta)}{(n-1+\delta)(n-2+\delta)} < \frac{2k^2}{n(n-k)}.$$

Restrict  $g$  to values  $\delta \geq 0$ . Then the function  $g'(\delta)(n-1+\delta)^2(n-2+\delta)^2$  is a polynomial of degree 2 in  $\delta$  (where  $g'$  is the derivation of  $g$ ). Hence  $g$  has at most two extrema. Since  $g(0) = g(2n-3) = 0$  and since  $g(\delta)$  is positive for  $0 < \delta < 2n-3$ , it follows that  $g$  has a unique extremum for  $0 < \delta < 2n-3$ . Hence  $\min\{g(\delta_1), g(\delta_2)\} \leq g(\delta)$  for all real  $\delta, \delta_1, \delta_2$  with  $0 \leq \delta_1 \leq \delta \leq \delta_2$ . Since  $4 \leq \delta \leq n-2$ , it follows that (3) is satisfied for  $\delta = 4$  or  $\delta = n-2$ . In view of  $k < \sqrt{2n}$ , the right hand side of (3) is smaller than  $4/(n-\sqrt{2n})$ . It follows easily in the case  $\delta = 4$  as well as in the case  $\delta = n-2$  that  $n \leq 18$ . Now  $k < \sqrt{2n}$  implies that  $k \leq 5$ . But then (3) is also not satisfied for  $n \in \{15, 16, 17, 18\}$ . This contradiction completes the proof of the proposition.  $\square$

## REFERENCES

- [1] N.G. DE BRUIJN - P. ERDÖS: *On a combinatorial problem*, Nederl. Akad. Wetensch. Indag Math. 10, (1948), 1277-1279.
- [2] Z. FÜREDI - J. KAHN: private communication.
- [3] Z. FÜREDI - L. SPISSICH: *The minimum size of a maximal partial plane*, preprint 1989.
- [4] R.G. STANTON - J.G. KLABFLEISCH: *The  $\lambda - \mu$  problem:  $\lambda = 1$  and  $\mu = 3$* , Proc. Second Chapel Hill Conf. on Combinatorics, Chapel Hill (1972), 451-462.
- [5] D.R. STINSON: *Pair-packings and projective planes*, J. Austr. Math. Soc. , Ser. A 37, (1984), 27-38.
- [6] S. VANSTONE: *The extendability of  $(r, 1)$ -designs*, proc. Third Manitoba Conf. on Numerical Math., Winnipeg 1973, 409-418.

*Lavoro pervenuto alla redazione il 22 gennaio 1991  
ed accettato per la pubblicazione il 25 maggio 1991  
su parere favorevole di A. Beutelspacher e di F. Eugeni*

INDIRIZZO DELL'AUTORE:

Klaus Metsch - Mathematisches Institut - Arndtstrasse 2 - D-6300 Giessen - Germany